



Strengthening Islamic Moderation in Indonesia

Yanuardi Syukur*

University of Indonesia & Khairun University

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.47134/pjpi.v2i2.1163>

*Correspondence: Yanuardi Syukur
Email: yanuardisyukur@gmail.com

Received: 11-11-2024

Accepted: 01-12-2024

Published: 08-01-2025



Copyright: © 2024 by the authors.
Submitted for open access publication
under the terms and conditions of the
Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY)
license
(<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

Abstract: Islamic moderation in Indonesia aims to create an Indonesian society that is religious and tolerant in a pluralistic society. This article explains an anthropologist's reflection on religious moderation implemented in Indonesia to create a moderate society. This article aims to explain an anthropologist's reflection on the Islamic moderation program in Indonesia which is indirectly included in the religious moderation of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of Republic of Indonesia. Practically, this reflection is useful to see how the Islamic moderation program is viewed from anthropological perspective. This article was using observations, participant observation and literature review. The author has been involved in various research programs in order to strengthening Islamic moderation in Indonesia. This article concludes that Islamic moderation in Indonesia is a necessity amidst the dynamics of global society. Practical strengthening of moderation is part of love for the Indonesian nation. However, this program will not run optimally unless it is through sustainable collaboration between the government, religious leaders, community leaders, youth and families.

Keywords: Religious Moderation, Islamic Moderation, Indonesia

Introduction

Indonesia is a nation-state with a population of 270 million people who are culturally, ethnically, linguistically and religiously diverse spread across 17,000 islands. As a pluralistic society, Indonesia consists of many religions such as Islam, Christianity, Catholicism, Hinduism, Buddhism and Confucianism, and is even home to religious beliefs that existed before Indonesian independent in 1945. Indonesia is called heaven of earth because this country is very rich in nature and socio-culture. Indonesia is also known as the lungs of the world, the emerald of the equator, the land of a thousand temples, a maritime country, an agricultural country, a megabiodiversity country as well as a tolerant country. However, since 2000 there have been various types of terrorism such as bom explosion, suicide bombings targeting embassies, highways, shopping center, terminals, and so on. The impact of this event—especially after 9/11—was that the Indonesian government then developed various programs, one of which was religious moderation.

In this article, religious moderation concept from the Ministry of Religious Affairs of Republic of Indonesia is interpreted the same as the concept of *wasathiyyatul Islam* or *Islam wasathiyah*. Criticism of religious moderation was once expressed by Muslim intellectual

from the Institute for the Study of Islamic Thought and Civilization (INSISTS) Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi in a discussion at the AQL Islamic Center (15 October 2021), that in the book *Religious Moderation* (Moderasi Beragama) “there is a sentence that needs to be understood somewhat, is a bit misleading” which according to Hamid has nuances of relativism, or nihilism, and according to him “moderation has nothing to do with *wasathiyah*”, and “[the] moderation program [is carried out] for political interests.” This critical view invites Muslims not to easily use Western terminology such as moderation, let alone equate it with the concept of *wasathiyah* in Islam. However, in this article, for the sake of ease of understanding between these two very close concepts, the author tends to equate Islamic moderation with *wasathiyah* considering that the meaning of both is very close in the middle meaning, namely not being excessive in religion.

Methodology

This article is inseparable from ‘going native’ which anthropologists practice in their research. In anthropological fieldwork, an anthropologist must be able to understand and even enter the mind of his informant which is called *emic*, then after that try to withdraw from the field and start an objective analysis which is called *etic*. Anthropologist Jack Eller (2009: 2) notes that anthropology does not approach religion to falsify or verify it or even judge it; anthropology is not a seminary that aims to indoctrinate its students into a particular religion. This is not apologetics, an attempt to prove or justify a religion; nor is this an attempt to refute any or all religions. Another anthropologist, Sidky (2015) says that questions about truth and falsity are thus not within the realm of anthropology. This methodological stance is thought to allow the study of other people’s religious beliefs and practices with minimal bias and remains the standard approach used by most anthropologists. However, according to the author, it is impossible for research related to religion itself to be able to distance itself from religion, especially regarding religious beliefs, and that is the challenge in anthropological research, namely how to achieve an objective level related to religious beliefs. For this reason, the position of this article is a reflection of research experience related to Islamic moderation which tries to be positioned back and forth, namely *emicly* and *ethically* at the same time. It is hoped that the *in-between* position can become a position in research related to religious beliefs.

Result and Discussion

1. Concept of Islamic Moderation

The concept of Islamic moderation in this article refers heavily to the perspective of the Ministry of Religious Affairs in the book *Religious Moderation* compiled by the Ministry of Religious Affairs Research and Development Agency or *Balitbang Kemenag* (2019). Islamic moderation is religious thought and practice that is balanced between practicing one’s own religion on the one hand and respecting the religious practices of people of different beliefs. *Balitbang Kemenag* (2019) defines *wasathiyah* as religious moderation, namely a balanced attitude or middle way in religious practice that avoids extreme right (ultra-conservative) attitudes on the one hand and extreme left (liberal) attitudes on the other. To practice Islam

in a moderate way means carrying out Islamic practices in a balanced and moderate manner personally (in beliefs, morals, character), socially, and when dealing with state institutions. Wasathiyah Islam is “the key to creating tolerance and harmony, both at the local, national and global levels” (Balitbang Kemenag, 2019).

The choice of moderation by rejecting extremism and liberalism in religion is the key to balance, solely for the sake of maintaining civilization and creating peace. If interactions between people are peaceful, then this world will also be peaceful. Treating other people in a respectful way, accepting differences, as well as living together and ‘supporting each other’s existence’ (pro-existence) is very important in our interconnected social life.

Islamic moderation has a basic principle, namely always maintaining a balance between two things. For example, balance between reason and revelation, physical and spiritual, rights and obligations, personal interests and communal benefits, and balance between past and future. This principle of balance is based on a perspective, attitude and commitment to always taking sides with justice, equality and humanity (see Dajani, 2015 and MUI Writers, 2020). So, the pretension to win alone is not relevant for building a diverse human life. Balitbang Kemenag (2019) wrote, “Those who have a balanced attitude means being firm, but not harsh because they always side with justice, only that their side does not take away other people’s rights to the point of harm. Balance can be considered as a form of perspective to do something in moderation, neither too much nor too little, neither conservative nor liberal (p.19).”

Mohammad Hashim Kamali (in Balitbang Kemenag, 2019) explains that the principles of balance and justice in the concept of moderation (*wasathiyah*) mean that in religion, a person must not be extreme in his views, but must always look for common ground. For Kamali, *wasathiyah* is an important aspect of Islam which is often forgotten by its followers, even though *wasathiyah* is the essence of Islamic teachings.

According to American Muslim scholar Ismail Raji Al-Faruqi (d. 1986), the meaning of balance (*tawazun*) or “the golden mean” is an attitude to avoid two unfavorable extreme poles, while trying to find a common ground to combine them. A balanced attitude means avoiding absolute selfishness on the one hand, and absolute selfishness on the other hand; pursuing personal happiness on the one hand, and maintaining collective happiness on the other. And so on, always take a balanced middle path (Balitbang Kemenag, 2019).

Religious moderation consists of four indicators, namely national commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and accommodating to local culture. These four indicators can be used to identify how strong religious moderation is practiced by someone in Indonesia, and how much vulnerability they have. This vulnerability needs to be recognized so that we can practically take appropriate steps to strengthen religious moderation.

2. Strengthening Islamic Moderation in Indonesia

As a religion of peace, Islamic values continue to be strengthened in society. In the midst of various challenges of the times, strengthening universal Islamic values such as peace, harmony, cooperation, dialogue, has become urgent, especially in a pluralistic society like Indonesia. Based on involvement in several researches related to radicalism,

terrorism and strengthening Islamic moderation, below I present several views related to how to strengthen Islamic moderation in Indonesia.

First, there needs to be an idea among Muslims that advancing religious life is a mandate from God. The lives of religious communities must be realized in a trustworthy manner in the light of justice and spread virtue and compassion to fellow humans. Islam is a religion of mercy. Allah says, "And We have not sent you, but (become) a mercy to the worlds" (Qur'an, Al-Anbiya: 107). M. Quraish Shihab wrote, "The Messenger of Allah was a blessing, not only did his arrival bring teachings, but his figure and personality were a blessing that Allah bestowed on him." Linking it to another verse related to mercy, "So, because of Allah's mercy, you act gently towards them" (Qur'an, Ali Imran: 159), Quraish Shihab stated that "a fragment of this verse can be one proof that Allah Himself educated and shaped the personality of the Prophet Muhammad." The exemplary personality (*uswatun hasanah*) of the Prophet Muhammad was formed by revelation from Allah, which made his heart clean, and by that he was totally "a blessing to all creatures" (Shihab, 2016: 134). Grace for nature then means mercy for a collection of living creatures of God, whether they live perfectly or are limited; both human, angel, spirits, animal and plant nature. According to Shihab, all of this received grace from the presence of the Prophet Muhammad who brought Islamic teachings (p.135).

Second, the importance of respecting human diversity. Plurality is the destiny of human creation. Differences in ethnicity, religion, race, class, and whatever is the *sunnatullah* that Allah presents to us. If God wanted everything to be uniform, of course it would be very easy, but God wants to show that humans are born with differences. However, all these differences remain within the light and guidance brought by the Prophets and Apostles. So, humans with all their minds and thoughts should think that differences are not in vain, but exist as a means of getting to know each other and helping each other to prosper the earth under the umbrella of Islamic values that bless all.

The pluralism of humanity should not be considered a disaster. Rather, it is a blessing to collaborate for the common good. Issues from terrorism to climate change require cooperation across organizations and countries. This collaboration can occur because there is a shared feeling that several things are detrimental to humans globally. Efforts to overcome this through cooperation regardless of religion, skin color and affiliation. So, in the context of contemporary Indonesian politics, the post-presidential election residue that divides society into binary opposition is not interesting to maintain. Why? Because humans are not born to be in constant opposition. Humans were created for cooperation. So, it is a great loss for those who maintain the oppositional conflict narrative.

Indonesia as a diverse nation is expected to be an example for other countries in healthy and harmonious social and cultural interactions. If we get along well then other countries will also learn from us. That is what then becomes the radiance of our Indonesianness outward, namely diplomacy with moderate, peaceful, harmonious values in ethnic differences within the national state. Harmony between Islamic, Christian, Catholic, Hindu, Buddhist and Confucian religions and beliefs here is worth preserving.

This is an important national asset as well as a real fact of unity in diversity, even though we are different we are still united.

Third, commit to obey as citizens of the nation. A Muslim is taught to use the constitution as a guide for the life of religious communities in the nation and state, and to obey the rules of law and mutual agreements. Islam teaches that from the beginning humans were created from different types, nations, ethnicities, the aim of which was to get to know each other (Qur'an, Al-Hujurat: 13). This difference can be said to be, undoubtedly, *sunnatullah*. The problem is not in the differences but in how to reconcile these differences in one common platform, *kalimatun sawa*. Allah SWT says in the Qur'an, Surah Ali Imran 64, "Say: 'O People of the Book, come (adhere) to a sentence (*kalimatun sawa*) where there is no dispute between us and you.'" The way to build and maintain religious diversity is by what Indonesian Istiqlal mosque grand imam Nasaruddin Umar (2019: 17-18) calls, "...communication built with goodwill as the main condition for building harmony" as the word of Allah SWT, "O people "Those who believe, stay away from most prejudices, indeed some prejudices are sin and do not find fault with others and do not gossip about others" (Qur'an, Al-Hujurat: 12).

In social interactions, the Prophet showed partiality to all groups without distinction of gender, ethnicity, religion and belief, as Allah said, "And indeed We have glorified the children of Adam" (Qur'an, Al-Isra: 70). This partisanship was practiced by Caliph Umar bin Khattab, for example when visiting Sham (Syria) and seeing a group of non-Muslims being punished for basking in the hot sun. By local authorities, they were punished because they were reluctant to pay taxes (*jizyah*). Umar then asked for them to be released, and asked the local authorities not to burden the people beyond their ability, and to treat them as they treat Muslims. At another time, wrote Ibnu Qayyim Al-Jauziyah, in *Ahkam Ahli Dzimmah*, as quoted by Nasaruddin Umar (2019), Caliph Umar Al-Faruq met an old and blind beggar who was a non-Muslim. The grandfather apparently needed food. Immediately, Umar made a memo to *Baitul Maal* (State Treasury) which contained: "Please pay attention to this person and people like this. By Allah, we do not realize that we have consumed his wealth and then we ignore him in his old age. Indeed, *sadaqah* (voluntary giving) is for the poor."

Pancasila is a meeting point for all the diversity of the nation. Diversity is a necessity, as Allah says, "And if your Lord had willed, He would have made you one people" (Qur'an, Al-Maidah: 48), but the fact is that we were not created in a geographical unit that is homogeneous in thought, affiliation, ethnicity, and group. This difference was realized by the founding fathers of the nation, who then made *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* (unity in diversity) as Indonesia great motto to integrate all people. Pancasila can be called a unifying force or melting pot that bridges various differences and interests within it. The flexibility of thought of our nation's leaders makes us live in dynamic, distinctive and unique interactions. In one year someone can travel to various ethnic groups in Indonesia, and be well received. As a melting pot, *Pancasila* (five principle of Indonesia: the belief in one God, just and civilized humanity, Indonesian unity, democracy under the wise guidance of representative consultations, and social justice for all the peoples of

Indonesia) brings us together towards civil society, namely a society that embodies Islamic values more dominantly as a consequence of the absolute majority population, but not in the legal-formal context of Islam as a state. Our civil society accommodates all existing elements while still paying attention to special elements in society (Umar, 2019: 177).

Fourth, be able to adapt to Indonesian society. Islam exists as an open religion, accommodating local strengths and potential that are the targets of its preaching. The revelation of Allah's 23 years of Qur'anic verses means that "introducing Islam does not require coercion", as Allah says, "There is no compulsion in religion" (Qur'an, Al-Baqarah: 256). Strengthening Islamic moderation requires time to give people the opportunity to think and choose according to the potential of the mind and soul that Allah has given them. Islam wants to eliminate the impression that Islam is heavy, difficult and burdensome; On the contrary, the Prophet Muhammad always showed that Islam is a religion that does not exist, and always presents a way out of every problem. At the level of gradual imposition, Islam shows the graduality of law, such as the gradual prohibition of alcohol (Qur'an, Al-Maidah: 90) and the practice of usury up to the prohibition of consuming usury (Qur'an, Al-Baqarah: 275). "It is this adaptive ethic," quoting Nasaruddin Umar, "...that makes Islam so quickly break through geographical boundaries and cultural layers and be accepted so amazingly amidst strict local teachings" (2019: 64).

Fifth, counteract efforts to delegitimize the state. State delegitimization is a problem in contemporary society. On the one hand, the government must not distance itself from Muslims because both support each other in achieving nation-building. Delegitimizing the 'role of the state in religion' on the one hand and the 'role of religion in the state' is not productive for the benefit of our nation. These two pendulum thoughts have the potential to cause unrest because they are not in line with our constitution imbued with religion. Religion-state relations must be harmonious in this country. That is why the Congress of the largest Islamic organization in Indonesia, Nahdlatul Ulama, in Banjarmasin (1936) confirmed the President of the Republic of Indonesia as *waliyyu al-amri ad-dharuri bi as-syauqah* or holder of the *dharuri* government with power and authority.

Sixth, strengthening moderate values in society. There needs to be continuous efforts to promote middle way or *wasathiyah* religious views, attitudes and practices. Socially and politically, Indonesia has a strong foundation for developing the idea of religious moderation. There are basic state principles adopted by Indonesia, and which really enable the growth of the moderate character of its people in nation, state and religion which can be explained as follows:

Indonesia is not a secular state, not a theocratic or religious state, but rather a national state that believes in God or religion. It is called a religious state if the country applies the law of one religion as national law. Indonesia as a religious nation state does not enforce certain religious laws. Indonesia is also not a secular country, because

Indonesia does not completely separate state affairs from religious affairs. Then, the state is obliged to provide broad and responsible guarantees and protection of religious freedom. Furthermore, the state protects diversity or diversity (heterogeneity) in religion, culture and race. The state's guarantee of diversity in society is a good medium for the growth of religious moderation. Every religious believer can express their religion without having to worry about pressure from other believers. Apart from that, each religious adherent will give appreciation for the religious expressions of other adherents. This is a concrete expression of religious moderation in society (Balitbang Kemenang, 2019).

Seventh, reinforcing dialogue as the cultural basis of Indonesian society. Indonesian people have long loved dialogue. This can be seen from the oral tradition that thrives in this country. Folklore from Sumatra, *Si Malin Kundang* to Javanese folklore, *Bandung Bondowoso* is closely related to oral culture. We have long been rich in oral traditions, which means they are related to dialogue. The role of intellectuals who are responsive to contemporary phenomena, such as having a “middle way” perspective, is very important in this area (see Aksin Wijaya et al., 2020). After 9/11, Indonesia played its global diplomacy in the form of dialogue between civilizations. Chairman of PBNU (1999-2004 and 2005-2009/2010), KH. Hasyim Muzadi (d. 2017) once initiated soft power diplomacy in the form of interfaith and intercultural dialogue at the International Conference of Islamic Scholars (ICIS). This initiative is very strategic as a contribution from Islamic boarding school students to show the face of Islam as moderate, tolerant and not pro-violence as well as as a “bridge for the brotherhood of the *ummah*.” This cultural diplomacy can be called ‘hands-up diplomacy’ (*diplomasi tangan di atas*)—borrowing Hassan Wirajuda’s words. As a result, this dialogue continues to be developed to this day, and is even carried out periodically between Indonesia and related countries.

Dialogue is a characteristic of Indonesian people. Establishing Islamic moderation is incomplete if there is no dialogue. We live in an earth of dialogue, so delivering da'wah also carries a nuance of dialogue. Even if we study the Qur'an, there are lots of dialogues that Allah conveys in it. For instance, the dialogue between Allah and Satan “why don't you bow down to Adam?” The devil has monotheism *rububiyah*, but does not have monotheism *uluhiyah*. Dialogue between father and son, for example between the Prophet Nuh and his disobedient son Kan'an. This is a sign that our good form of Islam is one that dialogues with the human mind and soul. So, the grounding of *wasathiyah* Islam requires dialogue, not orders like kings that seem to do no harm.

Furthermore, Islamic moderation can only be strengthened through collaboration. The Ministry of Religion plays an important role here. Several statutory regulations have been stipulated by the Ministry of Religious Affairs, including those relating to procedures for broadcasting religion, the Government issued SKB of the Minister of Religion and the Minister of Home Affairs No. 1 of 1979 concerning Procedures for Implementing Religious Broadcasting and Foreign Assistance to Religious Institutions in Indonesia, dated January 2 1979. To provide protection for religion, the Republic of

Indonesia Presidential Decree No. 1 of 1965 concerning Prevention of Abuse and/or Blasphemy of Religion and Criminal Code Article 156a which stipulates criminal penalties for religious blasphemy. In response to the many conflicts regarding the establishment of places of worship, the government has issued PBM No. 9 and 8 of 2006 concerning the Duties of Regional Heads in Maintaining Religious Harmony, Empowering FKUB and Establishing Houses of Worship. The government has a vision to balance the physical and mental development of Indonesian people, based on knowledge and religion simultaneously. It is hoped that the internalization of religious values can strengthen national commitment, rather than undermine it, so that the values instilled must be inclusive, tolerant, harmonious, non-violent, willing to accept differences, and respect each other's diversity. This is actually the message contained in religious moderation, namely returning to the essence of religion to uphold human dignity.

Religious figures also play an important role in religious moderation. They need to preach with a smile as a wise sentence states, "your smile is your logo, your personality is your business card." So, the business card of a religious figure is his smile. Indonesia is rich in religious figures. Starting from traditional Islamic boarding school alumni to universities there are also there. They should all work together in establishing *wasathiyah* Islam. In this post-truth era, sometimes there are misinterpretations, especially on social media. For this reason, friendships must continue to be held periodically. Our national problem is the lack of serious heart-to-heart friendships. We often see that there is friendship, but only in mouth, and after that we go home. There is no continuation. So, it is very important to have friendship between religious figures, whether they are young figures or adult and elderly figures. Everyone played their role in preaching *wasathiyah* Islam. In this context, our religious leaders need to bring society to see the light. The circle of fear that is often spread on social media must be destroyed. People need guidance and optimism to move forward, not narratives of fear that are spread to make people afraid. The character of the Indonesian nation is of course far from that.

Apart from religious figures, community figures in various realms of character also play an important role in strengthening Islamic moderation. There is an interesting story about 'special power' (*kesaktian*) and Indonesian people (in politic, see Bubandt, 2014). Buya Hamka, Indonesian ulama and great scholar tells how special the Indonesian people are from the Arab world. It could be said that this figure is a community figure in the field of traditional medicine, aka health massage. Henri Chambert-Loir (2013) quotes Hamka's writing that King Ibnu Saud was very happy to use our nation's employees. His joy can be seen from the appointment to the position of head of the special guard police, Ibnu Saud, who is an Indonesian son. His name is Mustafa Guguk (Guguk, a village on the outskirts of Bukittinggi city, West Sumatra). His rank rose because one day a palace slave was born, either by stealing or by other mistakes. It's known that in the palace, many friends had dark eyes. No one dares to catch. Mustafa Guguk was ordered to capture successfully. This story wants to show that Indonesian public figures have unique strengths that can be a solution to certain problems.

Apart from that, young figures are also important to ground Islamic moderation. Their youthful enthusiasm and strength become extraordinary energy in grounding *wasathiyah* Islam. Now we see many Muslim influencers whose voices are heard by netizens. They are more followed than conventional voices which tend to be dogmatic. These young influencers should continue to increase their capacity so that the content they share is not shallow. They really need content deepening. Apart from being obtained through reading, experience, in-depth content can also be obtained from senior scholars or elderly scholars. They have eaten salt. His voice deserves to be heard and reflected back in an attractive and contemporary package.

Lastly, the family is also important as an agent of Islamic moderation. As the smallest unit of society and the first and foremost place of education for every citizen of the nation, the family has enormous potential to instill and foster the practice of religious moderation or *wasathiyah*. The Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia describes that the *sakinah* family is a peaceful family that reassures its family members and provides enormous benefits to society, the nation and the state. Such a family is of course built on the values of justice, mutuality and balance. This is a form that is in line with the principles of religious moderation or *wasathiyah*. The family should intervene in spreading moderate values in Indonesian society. This moderation will then have an impact on other nations in the world as a projection of friendly and tolerant Indonesian Islamic values.

Conclusion

In the midst of various challenges of the times, Indonesian Muslims play an important role in strengthening the Indonesian nation. Being a moderate Muslim does not mean leaving Islamic values, on the contrary it strengthens universal Islamic values for all humans which are spread in peaceful and tolerant ways. This article shows that Islamic moderation in Indonesia is important to strengthen not only in the work of bureaucrats, but also researchers, because as a Muslim researcher it is impossible to be separated from his intention to strengthen the academic realm as well as the practical realm of the object of his study. Moreover, currently Indonesia is developing the idea that research does not only stop at seeking knowledge but also needs to produce practical outcomes that can be applied in real terms.

References

- Balitbang Kemenag (2019). *Moderasi Beragama*. Jakarta: Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia
- Bubandt, N. (2014). *Democracy, Corruption and the Politics of Spirits in Contemporary Indonesia*. London and New York: Routledge
- Chambert-Loir, H. (2013). *Naik Haji di Masa Silam: Kisah-kisah Orang Indonesia Naik Haji (1482-1964)*. Jakarta: Kompas

- Dajani, M. (2015). "Fighting for Moderate Islam: Ideas and Activism on the New Front Line," 26 Februari 2015, Washington Institute, link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=k07Hva85rno> (accessed Oct 14 2023)
- Eller, D. (2009). *Introducing Anthropology of Religion: Culture to the Ultimate*. New York: Routledge
- MUI writers (2020). *Peran MUI dalam Praktik Wasathiyatul Islam di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Q-Media
- Umar, N. (2019). *Islam Nusantara: Jalan Panjang Moderasi Beragama di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Quanta
- Umar, N. (2019). *Geliat Islam di Negeri Non-Muslim: Sebuah Catatan Perjalanan*. Jakarta: Alvabet
- Sidky, H. (2015). *Religion: Anthropological perspective*. New York: Peter Lang
- Shihab, M. Q. (2016). *Tafsir Al-Mishbah: Pesan, Kesan dan Keserasian al-Qur'an* volume 8. Jakarta: Penerbit Lentera Hati
- Wijaya, A., et.al (2020). *Berislam di Jalur Tengah*. Yogyakarta: IRCiSoD
- Zarkasyi, H. F. (2021). Penyimpangan dalam Moderasi Beragama, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9kYYFdN_p7E (accessed Oct 20, 2023)